Heavy Quarkonia - I (Charmonium)

Simon Eidelman

Budker Institute of Nuclear Physics and Novosibirsk State University, Novosibirsk, Russia

Outline

1. 1^{--} $c\bar{c}$ states

- 2. Other charmonium(-like) states
- 3. Charged charmonium-like states
- 4. Conclusions

Zakopane

Introduction

- B factories were designed to study CP violation in $B\bar{B}$ at $\Upsilon(4S)$
- From ARGUS and CLEO times it was known that much richer physics in other energy domains was accessible with special methods of analysis: γγ → light and heavy quark mesons, τ leptons, charm, narrow Υ
- Huge statistics collected by BaBar (~500 fb⁻¹) and Belle (~1000 fb⁻¹) strengthened that and resulted in principally new studies,
 e.g., γγ → cc̄, initial-state radiation to qq̄ and cc̄, and spectacular observations in cc̄ and bb̄ with new states found, as well as detailed studies of various mesons of light quarks
- Progress of experiment stimulated theory resulting in many models: tetraquark, hybrid, molecules, hadrocharmonium or, alternatively, effects of close thresholds, coupled channels and rescattering
- Results from hadronic colliders coming in parallel, also very important BESIII at the Beijing tau-charm factory

What Is Luminosity?

• Instantaneous luminosity $(cm^{-2}s^{-1})$ – collider efficiency:

$$\mathcal{L} = f \frac{n_1 n_2}{4\pi \sigma_x \sigma_y},$$

 $BEPC2 - 10^{33}$, LHC (design) $- 10^{34}$, PEP2/KEKB $- 10^{34}$

• Integrated luminosity (cm⁻²) is the instantaneous luminosity integrated over time – yield/cross section (experiment efficiency):

$$\sigma = \frac{N}{\int \mathcal{L}dt\epsilon}$$

 $BESIII - 10 \text{ fb}^{-1}, \text{ ATLAS/CMS} - 300 \text{ fb}^{-1}, \text{ Belle2} - 50 \text{ ab}^{-1}$

• For $\sigma \sim 1 \text{ nb } 1 \text{ fb}^{-1}$ gives 10^6 events



Production from B-decay $(broad D^{**}, D_{sJ}, X(3872), Y(3940))$

Production from continuum $(D_{sJ}, \eta_c(2S), X(3940), \Sigma(2800))$

Two-photon production $(\eta_c(2S), \chi_{c2}(2P), Y(4350))$

Initial state radiation (Y(4260), Y(4360), X(4630), Y(4660))

Charmonia – General Picture

- Ten $c\bar{c}$ were found in 1974-1980: $J/\psi, \ \eta_c(1S), \ \chi_{c0}(1P), \ \chi_{c1}(1P), \ \chi_{c2}(1P), \ \psi(2S)$ below and $\psi(3770), \ \psi(4040), \ \psi(4160), \ \psi(4415)$ above the open charm threshold
- With η_c(2S) (in 2002) and h_c(1P) (in 2005) the cc̄ system seemed completely understood, but many new cc̄-like states decaying to cc̄X rather than to open charm unexpectedly were found. For some of them there is no place in the cc̄ spectrum.









Study of $e^+e^- \to \pi^+\pi^-\psi(2S)$ at Belle

With 980 fb⁻¹ Belle confirms $Y(4360) \rightarrow \psi(2S)\pi^+\pi^-$ discovered with ISR by BaBar in B. Aubert et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 98 (2007) 212001 and Y(4660) first seen by Belle in X.L.Wang et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 99 (2007) 142002



X.L. Wang et al., Phys. Rev. D 91 (2015) 112007





Exclusive modes seem to saturate Rafter subtracting the contribution of light (u, d, s) quarks. Small room only left for states with $D_s^{(*)}$ and charmed baryons

S.Eidelman, BINP

p.11/50

Summary on 1^{--} States

- Four well-known excitations of the J/ψ are confirmed in exclusive channels; first steps to disentangle decay mechanisms made. Larger data samples and additional decay modes needed to perform fits in the coupled-channel model to determine their parameters.
- New vector states observed (Y(4260), Y(4360), Y(4630), Y(4660)). Although well above open charm threshold, they decay to J/ψ(ψ(2S))π⁺π⁻. Energy dependence of cross sections may be affected by coupled-channel and rescattering (D^(*)D̄^(*)) effects
- The Y(3990) state of Belle is not confirmed by BaBar, but is not ruled out by them
- Are the $\psi(2S)\pi^+\pi^-$ state at 4660 MeV and $\Lambda_c^+\Lambda_c^-$ state at 4630 MeV the same?
- Interpretation is not straightforward and needs theory input.



Belle – S.-K. Choi et al., PRL 91 (2003) 262001; 152M $B\bar{B}$ pairs; 1080 cites! A $10.3\sigma J/\psi\pi^+\pi^-$ state with $M = (3872.0 \pm 0.6 \pm 0.5)$ MeV and $\Gamma < 2.3$ MeV Confirmed by CDF and D0 in $p\bar{p}$ and BaBar in B decays Seen and extensively studied at LHC

Zakopane

What do we know about X(3872)?

- $M_{\pi^+\pi^-} \approx M_{\rho}$ (violates isospin)
- Decays to $J/\psi\gamma$, $\psi(2S)\gamma \Rightarrow C = +1$
- $\mathcal{B}(\psi(2S)\gamma)/\mathcal{B}(J/\psi\gamma) = 2.46 \pm 0.64 \pm 0.29$
- Spin-parity analysis $\Rightarrow J^{PC} = 1^{++}, 2^{-+}$, finally $J^{PC} = 1^{++}$
- Doesn't decay to $\chi_{c1}\gamma$, $D\bar{D}$, $\gamma\gamma$, e^+e^-
- No charged partner, not an isovector
- Belle (BaBar) observed decays to $D^0 \overline{D}^0 \pi^0 (D^0 \overline{D}^{*0})$ with mass 3875 MeV, marginally OK with one state or could be two states, the rate much larger than that of $J/\psi \pi^+\pi^-$, many models suggested, but ...
- CDF: $M = 3871.61 \pm 0.16 \pm 0.19$ MeV Most precise! 0.19 ± 0.43 MeV below the $D^0 \bar{D}^{*0}$ threshold, no 2 states, $\Delta M < 3.6$ MeV at 95%CL



Determination of X(3872) Quantum Numbers – I

A study of $B^+ \to X(3872)K^+$, $X(3872) \to J/\psi \pi^+ \pi^-$, $J/\psi \to \mu^+ \mu^$ produced in pp at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV with $\int Ldt = 1$ fb⁻¹



About 38000 *B* candidates selected in $M(J/\psi\pi^+\pi^-K^+)$ in a $\pm 2\sigma$ range, a fit yields $5642 \pm 76 \ \psi(2S)$ events and $313 \pm 26 \ X(3872)$ (68% purity) R. Aaij et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 110 (2013) 222001

Determination of X(3872) Quantum Numbers – II

Analysis in 5D angular space $\Omega \equiv (\cos \theta_X, \cos \theta_{\pi\pi}, \Delta \phi_{X,\pi\pi}, \cos \theta_{J/\psi}, \Delta \phi_{X,J/\psi})$



The 2^{-+} hypothesis is rejected with 8.4σ significance

Determination of X(3872) Quantum Numbers – III



- Projections onto five 1D and ten 2D binned distr. are all consistent with 1⁺⁺
- Correlations between $\cos \theta_X$ and $\cos \theta_{\pi\pi}$ increase the separation btw. 1⁺⁺ and 2⁻⁺

1⁺⁺ rules out X(3872) as a conventional $\eta_{c2}(1^1D_2)$ state, $\chi_{c1}(2^3P_1) \ c\bar{c}$ disfavored by X(3872) mass, Possible exotics: $D^{*0}\bar{D}^0$ molecule, 4-q state, $c\bar{c}$ -molecule mixture

Summary on the X(3872)

- $J^{PC} = 1^{++}$ proved by LHCb
- $\chi_{c1}(2P)(1^{++})$ is not very likely considering the decay pattern, mass and observation of $Z(3930) = \chi_{c2}(2P)$
- Possible interpretations (in arbitrary order):
 - 1. an S-wave $D^0 \overline{D}^{*0}$ molecule (loosely bound $[c\overline{q}][\overline{c}q]$)
 - 2. tetraquarks (tightly bound $[cq][\bar{cq}]$)
 - 3. hybrids $(q\bar{q}$ -gluon)
 - 4. threshold effect (cusp)
 - 5. a $D^0 \overline{D}^{*0}$ molecule mixed with $c\overline{c}$
 - 6. hadrocharmonium $c\bar{c}$ $(J/\psi, \ldots)$ in the excited light-hadron matter

Y(4140) at CDF – I

- First evidence (3.8 σ) from CDF as $B^+ \to Y(4140)K^+$, $Y(4140) \to J/\psi\phi$, $N = 14 \pm 5$, $M = (4143.0 \pm 2.9 \pm 1.2)$ MeV, $\Gamma = (11.7^{+8.3}_{-5.0} \pm 3.7)$ MeV, T.Aaltonen et al., PRL 102 (2009) 242002
- Belle searched for Y(4140) in *B* decays with a negative, but not inconsistent with CDF result, J.Brodzicka, LP-09
- Belle also didn't see Y(4140) in $\gamma\gamma$, but found evidence for Y(4350) with 3.2σ significance
- In 1101.0658 CDFII reports x2.2 (6 fb⁻¹) and confirms Y(4140)
- As before, they use $J/\psi \to \mu^+\mu^-$ and $\phi \to K^+K^-$
- The first state of two heavy quarkonia $c\bar{c}s\bar{s}$

Zakopane



at 4274 MeV (3.1 σ) with 19 ± 7 and 22 ± 8 events

S.Eidelman, BINP

p.21/50



S.Eidelman, BINP

p.22/50

Search for Y(4140) at LHCb – II

- LHCb observes 382 ± 22 events of $B^+ \to J/\psi \phi K^+$ with 115 ± 12 at CDF
- LHCb: < 16 events of $B^+ \to X(4140)K^+$ with $35 \pm 9 \pm 6$ expected from CDF, 2.4 σ disagreement

• LHCb:
$$\frac{\mathcal{B}(B^+ \to X(4140)K^+)\mathcal{B}(X(4140) \to J/\psi\phi)}{\mathcal{B}(B^+ \to J/\psi\phi K^+)} < 0.07 \text{ at } 90\%$$
CL

- CDF: $\frac{\mathcal{BB}}{\mathcal{B}} = 0.149 \pm 0.039 \pm 0.024$
- For X(4274), LHCb: < 24 events, 53 ± 19 expected from CDF
- LHCb: $\frac{\mathcal{BB}}{\mathcal{B}} < 0.08$, with 0.17 ± 0.06 at CDF
- Recently CMS and D0 also claimed its observation



Observation of Y(4140) at CMS



S. Chatrchyan et al., Phys. Lett. B 734 (2014) 261

S.Eidelman, BINP

p.25/50



A new state at 3820 MeV seen in $\chi_{c1}\gamma$ in addition to $\psi(2S)$! There is no signal at 3872 MeV in both modes B. Bhardwaj et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 111 (2013) 032001

New Charmonium State at Belle – II

- There is 3.8σ evidence for a new state at $3823.1 \pm 1.8 \pm 0.7$ MeV
- $\mathcal{B}(B^+ \to X(3820)K^+)\mathcal{B}(X \to \chi_{c1}\gamma) = (9.7^{+2.8+1.1}_{-2.5-1.0}) \cdot 10^{-6}$
- $\mathcal{B}(\chi_{c2}\gamma)/\mathcal{B}(\chi_{c1}\gamma) < 0.41$
- It is a 1^3D_2 or $\psi(1D)$ (ψ_2) state with $J^{PC} = 2^{--}$ expected at 3810-3840 MeV, it is narrow because $M < m_D + m_{\bar{D}^*}$, $D\bar{D}$ forbidden by P
- For X(3872) $\mathcal{BB} < 1.9 \cdot 10^{-6} \Rightarrow$ $\Gamma(X(3872) \to \chi_{c1}\gamma)/\Gamma(X(3872) \to J/\psi\pi^+\pi^-) < 0.26$ setting a constraint on the C-odd partner of X(3872)

B. Bhardwaj et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 111 (2013) 032001



S.Eidelman, BINP

p.28/50



M. Ablikim et al., arXiv:1503.08203

S.Eidelman, BINP

p.29/50



S.Eidelman, BINP

p.30/50

Observation of the $Z(4430)^{\pm}$ by Belle – I

S.-K. Choi et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 100 (2008) 142001 observed the very first charged charmonium-like state, $B \to K Z(4430)^{\pm}(\psi(2S)\pi^{\pm})$, using 657M $B\bar{B}$ pairs (605 fb⁻¹)



Confirmed by Dalitz plot analysis in R. Mizuk et al., Phys. Rev. D80 (2009) 031104 Not seen by BaBar with 413 fb¹, B. Aubert et al., Phys. Rev. D79 (2009) 112001

Observation of the
$$Z(4430)^{\pm}$$
 by Belle – II

Confirmed with full amplitude analysis and 772M $B\bar{B}$ pairs $J^P = 1^+$ is favored over the 0^- , 1^- , 2^- , 2^+ (3.4 σ , 3.7 σ , 4.7 σ , 5.1 σ)



K. Chilikin et al., Phys. Rev. D88 (2013) 074026

Confirmation of the $Z(4430)^{\pm}$ by LHCb

LHCb confirms it, $J^P = 1^+$, with $\times 10 \ B\bar{B}$ pairs



R. Aaij et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 112 (2014) 074026





Observation of the Charged $\chi_{c1}\pi^{\pm}$ State at Belle – II

Quantity	Belle	BaBar
Mass, MeV	$4051 \pm 14^{+20}_{-41}$	
$\Gamma, {\rm MeV}$	82^{+21+47}_{-17-22}	_
$\mathcal{BB}, 10^{-5}$	$3.0^{+1.5+3.7}_{-0.8-1.6}$	< 1.8 at 90% CL
Mass, MeV	$4248^{+44+180}_{-29-35}$	_
$\Gamma, {\rm MeV}$	$177^{+54+316}_{-39-\ 61}$	—
$\mathcal{BB}, 10^{-5}$	$4.0^{+2.3+19.7}_{-0.9-\ 0.5}$	< 4.0 at 90%CL

Belle: R. Mizuk et al., Phys. Rev. D78 (2008) 072004 BaBar: J.P. Lees et al., Phys. Rev. D85 (2012) 052003 Observation of the Charged $J/\psi \pi^{\pm}$ State – I

From analysis of the $J/\psi\pi^{\pm}$ mass in $Y(4260) \rightarrow J/\psi\pi^{+}\pi^{-}$ both BESIII and Belle find a charged structure $-Z_{c}(3900)^{\pm}$

Group	BES	Belle	
$\int \mathcal{L} dt$, fb ⁻¹	0.525	967	
Mass, MeV	$3899.0 \pm 3.6 \pm 4.9$	$3894.5 \pm 6.6 \pm 4.5$	
Width, MeV	$46 \pm 10 \pm 20$	$63\pm24\pm26$	
R,%	$21.5 \pm 3.3 \pm 7.5$	29.0 ± 8.9	
Events	307 ± 48	159 ± 50	
Ref.	PRL 110 (2013) 252001	PRL 110 (2013) 252002	



Observed in both $J/\psi\pi^+$ and $J/\psi\pi^-$ BES: M. Ablikim et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 110 (2013) 252001 Belle: Z.Q. Liu et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 110 (2013) 252002



Confirmation of $Z_c(3900)^{\pm}$ with CLEO Data

With 586 pb⁻¹ of CLEO data at 4.17 GeV $e^+e^- \rightarrow J/\psi \pi^+\pi^-$, $J/\psi \pi^0 \pi^0$ studied. They observe the $Z_c(3900)^{\pm}$ and find evidence for the $Z_c(3900)^0$.



T. Xiao et al., Phys. Lett. B727 (2013) 336





In $e^+e^- \rightarrow h_c \pi^+\pi^-$ a charged structure in $h_c \pi^{\pm}$ seen with mass $4022.9 \pm 0.8 \pm 2.7$ MeV and width $7.9 \pm 2.7 \pm 2.6$ MeV



M. Ablikim et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 111 (2013) 242001



BESIII: $\sigma(e^+e^- \to h_c \pi^0 \pi^0) \approx 0.5 \sigma(e^+e^- \to h_c \pi^+ \pi^-)$ at 4.23, 4.26 and 4.36 GeV, $h_c \to \eta_c(1S)\gamma, \eta_c \to X$ full recon., h_c in recoil to $\pi^0 \pi^0, \eta_c$ in recoil to $\pi^0 \pi^0 \gamma$



Narrow $Z_c(4020)^0$ is observed at $4023.9 \pm 2.2 \pm 3.8$ MeV M. Ablikim et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 113 (2014) 212002



In $e^+e^- \rightarrow D^*\bar{D}^*\pi$ at 4.26 GeV a charged structure seen in $D^*\bar{D}^*$ with mass $4026.3 \pm 2.6 \pm 3.7$ MeV and width $24.8 \pm 5.6 \pm 7.7$ MeV



M. Ablikim et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 112 (2014) 132001



S.Eidelman, BINP

p.44/50



Zakopane



S.Eidelman, BINP

p.46/50

Observation of the $\psi(2S)\pi^{\pm}$ at 4050 MeV at Belle

In a study of $e^+e^- \rightarrow \pi^+\pi^-\psi(2S)$ Belle finds a 3.5 σ charged $\psi(2S)\pi^{\pm}$ structure in Y(4360) decay with mass of $4054 \pm 3 \pm 1$ MeV and width of $45 \pm 11 \pm 6$ MeV



New Charmonium(like) States – I

State	J^{PC}	Process
$\eta_c(2S, 3639)$	0^{-+}	$B \to K(K_S K \pi)$
$\psi(3820)$	$2^{}$	$B \to \chi_{c1} \gamma K$
X(3872)	1^{++}	$B \to K(J/\psi \pi^+ \pi^-)$
X(3915)	$0/2^{?+}$	$B \to K(J/\psi\omega)$
$\chi_{c2}(2P, 3927)$	2^{++}	$\gamma\gamma \to D\bar{D}$
X(3940)	$?^{?+}$	$e^+e^- \to J/\psi(D\bar{D}^*)$
Y(3990)	1	$e^+e^- \to \gamma (J/\psi \pi^+\pi^-)$
Y(4140)	$?^{?+}$	$B \to K(J/\psi\phi)$
X(4160)	$?^{?+}$	$e^+e^- \to J/\psi(D^*\bar{D}^*)$
Y(4260)	1	$e^+e^- \to \gamma (J/\psi \pi^+\pi^-)$
X(4350)	$0/2^{++}$	$\gamma\gamma ightarrow J/\psi\phi$

New Charmonium(like) States – II

State	J^{PC}	Process
Y(4360)	1	$e^+e^- \to \gamma(\psi(2S)\pi^+\pi^-)$
Y(4630)	1	$e^+e^- \to \gamma(\Lambda_c^+\Lambda_c^-)$
Y(4660)	1	$e^+e^- \to \gamma(\psi(2S)\pi^+\pi^-)$
$Z_c(3900)^+$	1^{+}	$e^+e^- \to J/\psi\pi\pi, \ D\bar{D}^*$
$Z_c(4020)^+$	1^{+}	$e^+e^- \to h_c \pi \pi, \ D^* \bar{D}^*$
$Z_1(4050)^+$	$?^?$	$B \to K(\chi_{c1}(1P)\pi^+)$
$Z_c(4050)^+$	$?^?$	$e^+e^- \to \psi(2S)\pi\pi$
$Z_c(4200)^+$	1^{+}	$B \to K(J/\psi \pi^+)$
$Z_2(4250)^+$	$?^?$	$B \to K(\chi_{c1}(1P)\pi^+)$
$Z(4430)^{+}$	1^{+}	$B \to K(\psi(2S)\pi^+), \ K(J/\psi\pi^+)$

Conclusions and Future

- A large Zoo of new charmonium-like states has been discovered due to high statistics measurements and sophisticated analysis methods
- Some fit the $c\bar{c}$ family, some not and the family is not yet complete
- Nature of many states is still unclear (glueball, hybrid, tetraquark, molecule, hadrocharmonium, rescattering, ...)
- Charged states not fitting the quark model exist
- More theoretical efforts needed
- A lot of work for BESIII and LHCb as well as for future experiments – PANDA, BelleII and Super tau-charm factory
- Bottomonium analogues are very likely

Backup Slides

Zakopane



S.Eidelman, BINP

p.52/50



 1.9σ

 3.9σ

Zakopane

Charged $J/\psi\pi^+$ States in $\bar{B}^0 \to J/\psi K^-\pi^+$ at Belle					
J^P	0-	1-	1+	2-	2^{+}
Mass, Mev/c^2	4318 ± 48	4315 ± 40	4196^{+31}_{-29}	4209 ± 14	4203 ± 24
Width, Mev	720 ± 254	220 ± 80	370 ± 70	64 ± 18	121 ± 53

K. Chilikin et al., Phys. Rev. D 90 (2014) 112009

 8.2σ

 2.3σ

Significance

 3.9σ